

Peer Review Response

Read the attached essay. Then read the questions below and read the essay again to respond to these questions on a separate sheet. Use the questions below to guide your discussion: deal with one at a time, but don't be bound by them – some may not be relevant, and you may have questions of your own in mind. Keep in mind two things:

- *writers respond best to feedback that is friendly, honest, thoughtful and critical*
 - *setting priorities helps. What is the most important thing that you want to tell this writer? Start there. You should address at least six of these questions.*
-

1. What is the author's central issue or question and what is their perspective on it? Where in the essay is it stated? Do you have any suggestions for modifying or clarifying this perspective? If the perspective or argument is not clearly stated but only implied: what do you *think* the writer is arguing? What appears to be their perspective on the issue or question? State it.
2. What are the main points the writer is making in relation to his or her perspective? *Underline them in the essay.* Is supporting evidence used in a variety of ways: to qualify, explain, expand on an idea, or offer a counter argument? Write how it is used in margin. If the writer has used his or her evidence in only one way (to support their perspective), let him or her know two places where evidence might be introduced in another way.
3. Where in the essay did you feel like you needed more information, more development? Go to that place and write two questions to help the writer develop that idea. Tell the reader what you'd like to hear more about.
4. What writers that we have read come to mind as you read this? What point? Find the page of the text and write the author's name and the page number in margin of essay.
5. Were there any places in this essay where you felt lost or confused? Write the page number and paragraph number down and tell the writer what you were confused about.
6. Has the writer's thinking on this issue, question, changed in the essay? How? Where, near the end of the essay, might he or she incorporate this?
7. Find two places where you think the writing in the essay is strong and tell the writer why you think it is.
- 8) Are there any places in the essay where the writing distracts you from the discussion, or calls attention to itself because of errors, wordiness, confusion? Put an asterisk in the margin and write "wordiness" or tell the writer what's confusing.

Peer-editing sheet

Author:

Editor:

1. What is the thesis of the essay? Is it clearly expressed?
2. Is the thesis too general? How could it be more specific and well-defined?
3. Does the title reflect the author's argument? Could it be more descriptive or creative?
4. Introduction: Did the first paragraph capture your interest? How? What strategies did the author use to draw your attention?
5. Does the author offer a clear analysis of the points s/he proposes or is it a description? Does s/he include concrete examples to support his or her argument?
6. Vocabulary: Does the author use specific and descriptive terms? Is any word repeated too frequently?
7. Does the essay have a conclusion that opens up the argument to a broader context? What is the conclusion?
8. How could the organization of this essay be improved?

An Essay Checklist

Please assess the essay you are reading with the following questions in mind.

1. Thesis: What is the thesis? Does this thesis go beyond merely *describing* the work(s) at hand and present a claim that isn't obviously true? Does the thesis appear in the right place?

2. Introduction: Does the introduction bring the reader into the world of the essay and provide the necessary context for the thesis? Does it avoid grandiose claims?

3. Structure: Is the structure of the paper logical and clear? Does the paper progress from the lesser arguments to the strongest argument? Does the paper move from point to point in such a way that the reader can follow with ease? Are transitions between different arguments clear? Are transitions between different paragraphs in the same argument clear?

4. Evidence: Are the arguments supported with sufficient evidence? Is each major point supported with evidence from the texts? Is evidence introduced with care and then (after the quotation) analyzed so that the connection to the main point or thesis clear?

5. Paragraphs: Do paragraphs begin with clear topic sentences? Does each major point get (at least) its own paragraph? Does each paragraph give adequate support to its topic sentence?

6. Proofreading: Are there a number of surface errors that imply that the essay has not been proofread? Is there evidence that this draft has been read by someone other than the author?